

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA  
BILLINGS DIVISION

**FILED**

MAR 09 2018

Clerk, U S District Court  
District Of Montana  
Billings

CHRISTINE COLLIER, also known as  
Christine Parkinson, VICTORIA  
"VICKI" COLLIER, and NATHAN  
COLLIER,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

TIM FOX, in his official capacity as  
Attorney General of Montana, STEVE  
BULLOCK, in his official capacity as  
Governor of Montana, SCOTT  
TWITO, in his official capacity as  
Yellowstone County Attorney, and  
TERRY HALPIN, in her official  
capacity as Clerk of the Yellowstone  
County District Court,

Defendant.

CV 15-83-BLG-SPW

ORDER ADOPTING  
FINDINGS AND  
RECOMMENDATIONS

Before the Court are United States Magistrate Judge Timothy Cavan's Findings and Recommendations filed on February 22, 2018. (Doc. 99). Judge Cavan recommends that this Court grant Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. 67), deny the Colliers' Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. 75) and Motion in Limine (Doc. 73), and deny the Defendants' Motion to Strike (Doc. 92).


Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1), the parties were required to file written objections within 14 days of the filing of Judge Cavan's Findings and Recommendations. No objections were filed. When neither party objects, this Court reviews Judge Cavan's Findings and Recommendations for clear error. *McDonnell Douglas Corp. v. Commodore Bus. Mach., Inc.*, 656 F.2d 1309, 1313 (9th Cir. 1981). Clear error exists if the Court is left with a "definite and firm conviction that a mistake has been committed." *United States v. Syrax*, 235 F.3d 422, 427 (9th Cir. 2000). After reviewing the Findings and Recommendations, this Court does not find that Judge Cavan committed clear error.

IT IS ORDERED that the proposed Findings and Recommendations entered by United States Magistrate Judge Cavan (Doc. 99) are ADOPTED IN FULL.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. 67) is GRANTED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the Colliers' Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. 75) is DENIED. Accordingly, the Colliers' Motion in Limine (Doc. 73) and the Defendants' Motion to Strike Previously Undisclosed Evidence (Doc. 92) are DENIED as moot.

DATED this 9th day of March, 2018.

  
SUSAN P. WATTERS  
United States District Judge